

Table of Contents

Mục lục

Human capital development in East Asia: An empirical implication for Vietnam's education and training needs 1

Phát triển nguồn nhân lực ở Đông Á: Hàm ý thực nghiệm đối với nhu cầu giáo dục và đào tạo của Việt Nam

Joseph Thean Chye Lee, Go You How

Human resource planning reforms in South Korea: Implications for Ho Chi Minh city 13

Cải cách quy hoạch nguồn nhân lực ở Hàn Quốc: Hàm ý đối với Thành phố Hồ Chí Minh

Nguyen Phan Thu Hang, Le Lan Huong

The needs for Japanese-speaking human resources in Vietnam/ Japan, and language education 23

Nhu cầu nhân lực nói tiếng Nhật tại Việt Nam/ Nhật Bản và giáo dục ngôn ngữ

Matsuda Yukiyooshi

A study on impact of accounting education on improving the quality of human resource accounting 30

Nghiên cứu về tác động của giáo dục kế toán đối với việc nâng cao chất lượng nguồn nhân lực kế toán

Pham Ngoc Toan, Le Quang Man

Factors affecting the tourist's behavioural of booking tours via online network in the new stage: Case of Ho Chi Minh city 43

Các yếu tố ảnh hưởng đến hành vi của khách hàng khi đặt tour du lịch trực tuyến trong bối cảnh mới: Trường hợp Thành phố Hồ Chí Minh

Bui Mai Hoang Lam

Ranking criteria of university lecturers' happiness index in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam 59

Xếp hạng các tiêu chí đo lường hạnh phúc của giảng viên đại học tại Thành phố Hồ Chí Minh, Việt Nam

Huynh Dang Bich Vy, Nguyen Le Hoang Thuy To Quyen

Current status of nutritional knowledge and dietary behaviors of students at the University of Sports Ho Chi Minh city 73

Mối quan hệ giữa kiến thức dinh dưỡng và hành vi ăn uống của sinh viên trường Đại học Thể dục Thể thao Thành phố Hồ Chí Minh

Nguyen Minh Xuan Huong, Nguyen Van Tang, Nguyen Tan Danh, Nguyen Minh Xuan Hong

COMMUNICATION

Thông tin khoa học

Linking the Mekong Delta region in the development of agriculture model in combination with tourism 83

Liên kết vùng Đồng bằng sông Cửu Long trong phát triển mô hình nông nghiệp kết hợp du lịch

Tu Minh Thien

Identifying the development of high - quality tourism human resources in Vietnam when joining the international labor market and issues to solve 96

Nhận diện sự phát triển nguồn nhân lực du lịch chất lượng cao của Việt Nam khi gia nhập thị trường lao động quốc tế và những vấn đề cần giải quyết

Pham Xuan Hau

COMMUNICATION

**IDENTIFYING THE DEVELOPMENT OF HIGH-QUALITY
TOURISM HUMAN RESOURCES IN VIETNAM WHEN
JOINING THE INTERNATIONAL LABOR MARKET AND
ISSUES TO SOLVE*****Pham Xuan Hau***Van Hien University**Email: haupx@vhu.edu.vn**Received: 08/06/22; Accepted: 06/07/2022***Abstract**

The process of regional and international integration has been taking place deeply and widely in all areas of life, economy - society, including the tourism industry. The change in management, business, and consumer demand in tourism activities is setting standards on high-quality human resources in terms of quantity, qualifications, professional knowledge and professionalism when participating in tourism activities and entering the international labor market. It is also a critical point that is being set for Vietnam when implementing the strategic goal of developing tourism human resources in the process of participating in integration. The article presents a number of related contents about identifying development drivers and the overall picture of the current situation, forecasting human resource needs of Vietnam's tourism human resources up to 2030, and issues that need to be resolved, and at the same time, giving some solutions and recommendations to develop tourism human resources in Vietnam when participating in the international labor market.

Keywords: *tourism human resources, human resources, tourism integration*

1. Introduction

With its position as a spearhead economic sector in the process of national economic development, Vietnam's tourism in recent years has had strong development, achieving high growth rate in the number of visitors and income. In the period 2013-2019, international tourists to Vietnam

increased by an average of 16.01%/year, reaching the highest level of 18.0 million arrivals in 2019; domestic tourists increased by an average of 17.57% per year, reaching the highest level of 85 million visitors in 2019; total tourist arrivals in 2019 reached over 103 million, 2.42 times higher than in 2013. Total revenue from tourists grew up

* Selected from The International Conference "Supply and demand of high-skilled labor for East Asian countries in digital transformation: challenges and solutions for Ho Chi Minh City" held in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam on 29th June 2022

by an average of 25% per year, contributing about 8.1% to GDP (2018). The high growth index is a good sign for Vietnam's tourism industry. However, in the context of globalization and deepening and widening international integration; the domestic and international situation has many fluctuations; along with the impact of the 4th industrial revolution taking place strongly, profoundly changing the way of tourism management, business and consumption. Vietnam's tourism industry is facing many difficulties and challenges such as development policies; management mechanisms; quantity and quality of products; tourism services; association - cooperation etc; especially in which, the requirement to ensure high quality and professional tourism human resources to participate in the regional and international labor market, as well as to meet the requirements of the process of cooperation and exchange, are matters that need to be resolved quickly for both short-term and long-term period.

2. Motivations for developing Vietnamese tourism human resources when participating in the international labor market

2.1. The legal corridor and motivational factors

Support from the Party and Government: Over the years, the Communist Party and the Government have issued many resolutions on policies and strategies for tourism development in Vietnam, creating favorable legal regulation for the development of the tourism industry in general and tourism

human resources in particular.

Vietnam's tourism development strategy to 2020, and vision to 2030 defines: "Developing tourism human resources to ensure quality and quantity, balance in terms of industry structure and training level to meet requirements demanded for tourism development and international integration" (Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, 2016), "particular attention is paid to tourism human resources managers and highly skilled workers" (Prime Minister, 2011). Resolution No. 08-NQ/TW affirms "Promoting the application of advanced science and technology in training, fostering and developing tourism human resources", "improving the quality of human resources in government, business and tourism" (Communist Party of Vietnam Central Committee, 2017). The Law on Tourism (2017) also clearly states: "The government has policies to encourage and support training activities and develop tourism human resources" (The National Assembly, 2017).

The tourism market: The goal of welcoming 10 - 10.5 million international tourists and 47 - 48 million domestic tourists (2020) has become a modest goal since 2018. In fact, Vietnamese tourism welcomed about 15, 5 million international visitors, serving over 80 million domestic tourists recorded in 2018. Then, in 2019, Vietnamese tourism welcomed 85 million domestic visitors and 18 million international visitors. The growth of international visitors has set an important task for the supply of high-quality tourism human resources to meet the new growth

phase. However, from the beginning of 2020, due to the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic, the number of international tourists decreased significantly dramatically. According to statistics of the Vietnam National Administration of Tourism, in the entire year of 2020, Vietnam only welcomed 3.8 million international visitors (reaching about 36% of the target), the number of domestic

tourists reached about 65% of the target.

The drop in the number of visitors mentioned above was only temporary fluctuations. In 2021, the tourism industry has developed a plan to overcome with the goal of welcoming 80 million domestic tourists, so the demand for high-quality human resources for the long term still needs to be met regularly and continuously.

Table 1. International and domestic tourists 2013-2019

No	Year	Domestic tourists		International tourists	
		Number (million)	Growth rate (%)	Number (million)	Growth rate (%)
01	2013	35,00	-	7,57	-
02	2014	38,05	10,00	7,87	4,00
03	2015	57,00	48,00	7,94	0,90
04	2016	62,00	8,80	10,01	26,01
05	2017	73,20	18,10	12,92	29,07
06	2018	80,00	9,30	15,49	19,89
07	2019	85,00	10,62	18,00	16,20

Source: Vietnam National Administration of Tourism

The competitiveness: According to the World Economic Forum (WEF), in 2017, Vietnam's tourism ranked 67/136 among countries and territories, and the human resource and labor market index ranked 37/136 (in 2019). Overall ranking of Vietnam has increased by four places (63/140), but the human resource and labor market index decreased by 10 places, from 37th position to 47th position (World Economic Forum (WEF), 2019). In ASEAN, the human resources and labor market of Vietnamese tourism labor market ranked

sixth, above Laos (67th) and Cambodia (95th), below Singapore (5th), Malaysia (15th), Thailand (27th), Philippines 37th) and Indonesia (44th place) (WEF, 2019). It is worth mentioning that the human resource and labor market indexes of most ASEAN countries have increased, but the rankings of Vietnam and Laos have decreased. The decline in competitiveness (2017-2019) was a warning for the slow development of high-quality human resources in the regional and international labor market of Vietnam both now and in the future.

Table 2. The ASEAN Human Resources and Labor Market Competitiveness Index

Countries ranking	Vietnam	Thailand	Singapore	Malaysia	Indonesia	Philippines	Laos	Campuchia
General ranking 2017	67	34	13	26	42	79	94	101
Human resources and labor market	37	40	05	22	64	50	65	110
General ranking 2019	63	31	17	29	40	75	97	98
Human resources and labor market	47	27	05	17	44	37	67	95

Source: WEF, 2019

2.2. Current situation of human resources, demand and training of human resources in the tourism industry

2.2.1. Current situation of human resources

The total number of employees in the tourism industry in 2017 was more than 2.5 million, including about 750,000 direct workers and about 1,750,000 indirect workers, accounting for about 4.5% of the total number of employees in Vietnam. Out of a total of 750,000 direct workers (2017), 20,416 were tour-guides (accounting for 2.7%), including more than 12,000 international tour-guides and more than 8,000 domestic tour-guides (Institute for Tourism Development Research, 2019); in 2019, according to statistics of the Vietnam National Administration, the whole country had over 2.5 million employees, including 860,000 direct workers with 45% trained in tourism, 35% trained in other specialties and 20% untrained.

The proportion of workers with tourism expertise (trained and fostered in tourism) accounts for about 42% of the total number of employees in the industry, 38% are trained from other industries and about 20% are not trained. Among the total 42% of employees who are trained in tourism, 10% have undergraduate and postgraduate degrees (accounting for 3.5% of the total number of employees in the industry); 50% have elementary, intermediate and college degrees (accounting for 20% of the industry's workforce); The remaining 40% is trained in short-term classes. About 60% of employees in the tourism industry know and use different foreign languages; in which, English accounts for the highest percentage (more than 50%); Chinese, French, Russian and other languages make up a lower percentage (Institute for Tourism Development Research, 2019).

2.2.2. Demand for human resources in the tourism industry

Table 3. Demand for human resources in the tourism industry by training level until 2020

Criterion	2010 (people)	2015 (people)	Average growth (%)	2020 (people)	Average growth (%)
Post-graduate	1,450	2,400	13.1	3,500	9.2
University, College	53,800	82,400	10.6	113,500	7.5
Intermediate and equivalent	78,200	115,300	9.5	174,000	10.2
Elementary	98,700	151,800	10.7	231,000	10.4
Below elementary level (Apprenticeship at local level)	187,450	268,299	8.6	348,300	5.9
Total	419,600	620,190	10.5	870,300	8.64

Source: Institute for Tourism Development Research, 2019

2.2.3. Activities in training and developing tourism human resources

Training activities: In recent years, the system of tourism training institutions has been developed in the localities. Currently, the country has 192 tourism training institutions, including 62 universities with tourism departments, 55 colleges (including 10 schools specializing in tourism training); 75 intermediate schools and vocational training centers (Le Anh Tuan, 2019). The tourism industry is developing and standardizing the tourism vocational training system to meet the national tourism professional standards equivalent to diplomas so that they can reach an agreement on mutual recognition of tourism professions in ASEAN (MRA-TP). With the technical support of the project “Environmentally and Socially Responsible Tourism Capacity Development Programme” (EU-ESRT), the tourism vocational training system based on the Vietnam Tourism Occupational Skills Standards (VTOS) is sustainably maintained in the whole industry.

The technological level of human

resource in tourism: According to Vietnam ICT Index 2018 (Ministry of Information and Communications, 2018), Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism was ranked 5th out of 19 ministries and sectors (up 1 rank compared to 2017); ranked 4th in the IT human resource infrastructure index (up 2 ranks compared to 2017). The whole industry formed over 60% of employees who were able to use computers and technology equipment for work, but mainly for simple jobs.

The forecast on labor demand to 2030: For the forecasted indicators of labor and jobs in tourism: By 2020, Vietnam’s tourism will create jobs for about 3.1 million workers, including more than one million direct workers and more than two million indirect workers. By 2025, Vietnam’s tourism will create jobs for about 4.5 million workers, including more than 1.5 million direct workers and more than three million indirect workers. By 2030, Vietnam's tourism will create jobs for more than seven million workers, including more than 2.3 million direct workers and more than 4.6 million indirect workers (Table 4).

Table 4. Forecast of labor demand in the tourism sector in the country by 2030

(Unit: Person)

Type of resource	2020	2025	2030
Direct labor	1.040.000	1.530.000	2.340.000
Indirect labor	2.080.000	3.060.000	4.680.000
Total	3.120.000	4.590.000	7.020.000

Source: Institute for Tourism Development Research, 2019

2.3. Impacts of the 4th Industrial Revolution

The evidence shows that the development of the economy - society is moving strongly in the direction of reaching a “flat world”, the integration process of countries is proving this trend. In particular, the Industrial Revolution 4.0 (Industry 4.0) has been creating many new job opportunities in the tourism industry, creating favorable conditions for the training and development of high-quality human resources in tourism, opening up new tourism trends - high technical tourism, smart tourism, virtual reality tourism and many new jobs appearing (tour guides, technicians, marketing staff, online salesmen and customer care staff in the tourism industry). New forms of training such as: distance learning, online training (e-learning) with process and methods, online teaching and learning, using electronic lectures and electronic documents from electronic institutes, tests/ exams, online degrees/ certificates, etc., creating favorable conditions for both learners and teachers, contributing to promoting training, developing tourism human resources and meeting the needs of human

resources and the diverse needs of society.

3. Problems which Vietnamese tourism human resources face when participating in the international labor market

Vietnam has been having an investment policy for the development of human resources in general and human resources in tourism with high quality in particular (both qualified and professional, etc.) to participate in the regional and international labor market. However, there are still many problems that need to be paid attention to overcome and thoroughly resolve to have a high-quality human resource team, bringing success when participating in the supply and exchange in the region and international market, especially when Industry 4.0 is deeply penetrating this field.

3.1. Lack of system in planning to develop high-quality human resources in tourism

Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Ministry of Labor - Invalids and Social Affairs, Ministry of Education and Training have not yet reached a high consensus on the management mechanism and tasks to develop human resources for

the workforce in the tourism industry, leading to the situation:

- There is no appropriate master planning strategy on human resources development in tourism through attracting from the outside and training human resources in different forms and levels, leading to rampant development. On the other hand, there is a lack of attention and strict supervision, so the quality is not synchronized with the standards. Industry 4.0 poses a challenge with the indispensable criteria to form a high-quality factor, namely the *qualifications, knowledge and skills in using technology* of both managers and employees when they have to understand, proficiently use a number of basic technologies, especially information technology and communication and understand the core technologies of Industry 4.0 and its applications to the tourism industry.

- There is no consensus in training stratification at all levels. There are still colleges, intermediate schools, vocational intermediate schools, vocational certificates in universities following different programs, leading to the major consequence that the vocational labor market is not synchronous in terms of standardized quality of national and regional standards, etc. Up to now, there is still not a sufficient set of criteria and “standardized” standards for training levels, especially high-level training.

University-level training institutions are places of high-level training, but:

- The programs are quite different despite the same training code.

- There has not been a consensus on the recognition of a common use program to recognize each other’s training results, so it is difficult to implement program inter-school programs. Teachers also can not connect to support each other. All these factors make students not have the opportunity to gain experience quickly to shorten the learning time.

- *Industry 4.0 poses the challenge of renovating the human resources training system in tourism.* The training program and training content need to increase the number of credits for the IT and technology application modules and the change in technical facilities for teaching and learning (classrooms, libraries, practice rooms, etc.), changing teaching methods, tools and teaching means, including changing human resources at tourism training institutions.

Facilities and equipment for practical training and skill improvement at training institutions from low to high are still outdated and have not had timely access to modern technologies. Especially at universities, only few schools have internships and practice facilities, and most of the facilities do not have enough facilities for practice and internship.

3.2. The quantity and quality of human resources is insufficient and weak to meet the demand

According to a forecast of the Institute for Tourism Development Research, by 2025, about 2,090,000 more workers will be needed (direct labor is 780,000 people) and by 2030 about 4,520,000 more workers will be needed (direct workers are 1,590,000 people). With an average annual

growth rate (an increase of more than 60,000 direct workers/year), by 2020, the total direct labor had increased to 930,000 employees, (compared to the forecast, there was a shortage of about 110,000 workers). Similarly, by 2025, there will be a shortage of about 300,000 employees. Moreover, there will be a shortage of about 810,000 employees in 2030. Analyzing the current situation of tourism human resources in Vietnam, it shows that the development of human resources in tourism in recent times has had positive changes, reflected in an increase in both quantity and quality (in the period from 2011 to 2017, there was an average increase of 12.4%/year, 42% of workers were trained in tourism). The development of human resources in tourism also reveals many limitations such as: **(i)** The imbalance between regions, areas and fields of activity (there are shortages in some places and there are excesses in some places) between high-quality labor and unskilled labor, unskilled workers and professional workers; **(ii)** Untrained workers and those working in the unsuitable sector account for a large proportion compared to formal training in tourism (58%/42%). Especially, workers with university and postgraduate degrees (in the right sector) have a low proportion (only 3.5% total labor of the whole industry); **(iii)** According to statistics of Vietnam National Administration of Tourism, currently, about 60% of the industry's workforce can proficiently use computers and technological equipment for work, but mainly for simple jobs. The number of staff with professional qualifications in

information technology working at tourism management agencies is too small (accounting for only 9.3%/workforce in tourism). The application of IT in human resource training institutions in tourism is still limited, the material and technical infrastructure and the technological infrastructure equipped for the training institutions is low, so the high-quality training and human resources supplying to the industry has many difficulties. Therefore, it has reduced the competitiveness index of human resources and the labor market has dropped seriously (in 2019, it decreased by 10 ranks compared to 2017). Meanwhile, ASEAN countries have improved significantly (Table 2)

3.3. The capacity of training institutions does not really guarantee high quality training

The program and content of training programs are not synchronized. There is no connection between educational levels, so human resource training schools in tourism need to be paid attention. Moreover, in the process of changing, supplementing and improving the training program, this will lead to changes in both technical facilities and teaching and learning facilities such as classrooms, libraries, practice rooms, equipment, teaching methods, learning methods and even human resources (management staff, executive staff, lecturers, etc.) at training institutions. This is not an easy job to do and cannot be done quickly.

The number of human resources involved in the field of tourism training is lacking and weak. Currently, the whole

industry has about 2,000 lecturers, managers and staff at training institutions; including about 12 professors and associate professors, 36 doctors and 210 masters. According to a recent survey by Nguyen Quyet Thang (Ho Chi Minh City University of Technology), the level of IT application in teaching by lecturers of 6 universities in Ho Chi Minh City is quite low, with only 9.2% of lecturers using IT usually, 18.3% using it frequently, 26.4% using it often, 36.6% using it occasionally and 9.5% using it rarely (Nguyen Van Dinh, 2019: 243).

Currently, in human resource training, Vietnam is applying the Vietnam Tourism Occupational Skills Standards (VTOS) (2013 version) for 13 key job positions in tourism. Basically, this set of standards clearly stipulates specific standards and criteria in each job position. However, the Industrial Revolution 4.0, along with the strong development of tourism from 2016 to the present, requires an increasing use of technology in all jobs (especially in human resource training). With the appearance of a number of new job positions, employees must have qualifications and skills to use technology proficiently. When 13 sets of tourism professional standards become outdated and not consistent with regional and international standards, it will have to be adjusted to suit the actual context and the development trend of the regional and international tourism industry.

The emergence of a new type of economy “Sharing economy” has been creating a shift of labor from other industries and fields to the tourism industry, manifesting in the fields such as technology

transport (technology taxi, technology motorbike taxi), online travel businesses (booking.com, agoda.com); agricultural - rural tourism, community tourism, craft village tourism, spiritual tourism, and the like organized directly or indirectly by farmers in the residential community (online sales for tourists in tourist areas and destinations); etc. These are also big challenges in the strategy of developing new human resources in tourism, especially high-quality human resource training institutions in tourism.

3.4. Lack of linkage and community responsibility between enterprises and training institutions

Tourism businesses, who receive and use human resources from domestic and international training institutions, include human resources from other countries for tourism activities.

- Tourism businesses are not taking the initiative in building specific and detailed strategic plans for human resource needs throughout their development process, to discuss, unify, sign agreements and place orders with training institutions at all levels, qualifications and types of workers; in order that training institutions can have training plans suitable for each type of capacity required by enterprises.

- Tourism businesses are making great efforts in supporting training institutions, helping learners experience and practice skills. However, these enterprises have not clearly shown their responsibilities in contributing to the development of training programs and assessing learners' results. Moreover, there

is a lack of initiative in the initial budget investment for training facilities.

Building a responsible community relationship between businesses and training institutions to create high-quality human resources to meet the needs of tourism businesses and social needs is a demanding question for both sides. It needs to be resolved at this stage and continues in the future.

In the task of planning human resource development in the tourism industry, many documents of the Government, the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Vietnam National Administration of Tourism have emphasized more indispensable criteria to form a high-quality factors, which are the level of education and training, knowledge and skills in using technology of employees in using proficiently some basic technologies, especially information technology and communication and its applications to the tourism industry; having the ability to approach and adapt quickly to the impacts on the tourism industry. This requires close and effective coordination between training institutions and tourism businesses.

3.5. The target market for tourism supply and exchange has not been clearly defined

The supply of labor market in tourism is remarkably diverse in terms of quantity, quality and qualifications in the region and international.

- The tourism industry has not had a complete source of information for each market on the demand for human resources in tourism for key fields and services in

tourism business such as accommodation (hotels, resorts), F&B (food and beverage service), culture, entertainment (amusement areas, sports, etc.), ancillary services (repair service, laundry, etc.) to provide assistance for training institutions to develop appropriate training plans.

- The identification of the target market to supply and exchange human resources is not clear, so the process of formulating a cooperation agreement is difficult and the feasibility is low. That leads to a situation which there are shortages in some industries and there are excesses in some industries; Human resources of all levels are insufficient in some places and abundant in some other places.

4. Some solutions and recommendations

4.1. Main solutions

To develop high-quality human resources in tourism in Vietnam to participate in the regional and international labor market in the context of Industry 4.0, it is necessary to implement appropriate and adaptive solutions:

4.1.1. Local authorities and tourism managers

- It is necessary to renew thinking and raise awareness about the role of high-quality human resources when participating in the international labor market, especially during the period with the impact of Industry 4.0 on the tourism industry because it can create great changes in the tourism industry, thereby increasing responsibility and initiative in human resources development activities for the industry in line with the general global

trend of professional qualifications, professional skills and technology skill in workplace. On the other hand, tourism management agencies at all levels should strengthen communication and raise awareness of employees so that they can take active measures to raise awareness, renew their thinking, learn to improve qualifications and capacity to work in the industry.

- Building and perfecting institutions, mechanisms and policies on human resource development in tourism. On the basis of amending, supplementing and promulgating new legal documents related to the demand for human resources in the tourism industry in general and high-quality human resources in tourism in particular to suit the needs of the labor market. Local authorities need to have policies to support and improve the training capacity of tourism vocational training institutions, in association with the application of advanced technology in training. Local authorities need to have a reasonable remuneration policy and mechanism to attract talents for the tourism industry, creating a favorable working environment, and a timely incentive and reward regime for employees so that they can actively innovate, create, research and study to improve professional qualifications and professional knowledge.

4.1.2. Tourism human resource training institutions

Managers and operators of training institutions must always determine the central political tasks of their institutions and their immediate and long-term goals

which are to improve the quality of training to create high-quality products, so they should pay attention to: **(i)** Regularly update and renew training programs and contents in line with international trends. At the same time, approach the innovation of teaching and learning methods, on the basis of modern technology of Industry 4.0 in all fields; **(ii)** Diversify forms and types of training; Combine domestic training with international training; Combine formal training and other forms of training; Increase the opening of short-term courses, train and retrain according to national and international standards and criterias; After graduation, they can immediately meet the requirements of the job positions with the qualifications and skills for their work; **(iii)** Focus on perfecting the technology infrastructure system in the tourism industry in order to create a working environment for teachers and students, have the ability to access and use advanced technology in teaching and learning activities. Upon graduation, employees can proficiently use online public services, digitize and technologize professional activities in tourism enterprises to adapt to online businesses; **(iv)** Promote international cooperation in training and scientific research activities; strengthen the exchange of experts, scientists and training institutions to send workers to study, retrain and improve their qualifications in countries with developed tourism industry and advanced technology in training tourism human resources at all levels; **(v)** There should be a legal mechanism to ensure the coordination between the

Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, the Ministry of Labor - Invalids and Social Affairs, the Ministry of Education and Training, the Ministry of Science and Technology, and corporate social responsibility with tourism training institutions in order to improve the quality of training, foster and develop tourism human resources to meet market needs in the integration period.

4.1.3. Tourism businesses

The tourism businesses have an obligation to: **(i)** Provide training institutions with information about the tourism market, especially the number of human resources which enterprises is having and will have in terms of the number, types and qualifications of workers that they use and provide information for tourism management agencies and training institutions to develop human resource plans in general and human resources training plans in particular; **(ii)** Proactively raise the requirements and standards that employees need to meet when they want to work in their enterprises according to specific job positions; **(iii)** Highlight the roles and responsibilities in supporting training institutions in giving advice on developing training programs; participating in teaching and evaluating results for training institutions; helping learners during internships at enterprises. At the same time, proactively develop a plan to improve qualifications, retrain the managers and employees of the enterprise so that training institutions can select and implement according to their capacity (Pham Xuan Hau and Nguyen Van Sy, 2015); **(iv)**

Considering the investment in external values (budget, conditions and learning facilities, etc.) and internal values (social responsibility - regular exchange of ideas, usage of employees...), signing training contracts and providing human resources for domestic training institutions and exporting human resources.

4.2. Some recommendations

The Government

It is necessary to have clearer and more specific guiding documents, guidelines and regulations for the tourism industry in general and the responsibility for developing tourism human resources in particular when participating in the international labor market in Industry 4.0. The Law on Tourism (2017) defines “The government has policies to encourage and support activities for training and developing tourism human resources, etc. Applying modern science and technology to support management and development in tourism” (Clause 4, Article 5). However, the Law and its implementing documents do not have specific provisions on this issue. In the future, the government needs to issue new and more specific policies to create conditions for the tourism industry to develop human resources to meet new requirements (participating in the international labor market) in accordance with the current context of Industry 4.0.

The Ministry of Labor - Invalids and Social Affairs, the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, the Ministry of Education and Training

It is necessary to research and develop a unified plan on a strategy to develop high-

quality tourism human resources which is suitable to the new context and situation. The Ministry of Labor - Invalids and Social Affairs, the Ministry of Education and Training, the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism and related sectors need to have the close coordination to synchronously develop mechanisms, policies and training plans in the human resource development strategy and high-quality tourism resources. The tourism human resources need to be capable of accessing and using advanced technology of Industry 4.0, as well as recruitment policies with remuneration mechanisms, incentive and reward policies for individuals and organizations who are innovative in improving working productivity, quality and efficiency, etc. At the same time, they agree to identify the target market - the key to supply and exchange human resources for tourism activities.

Departments of Tourism (local tourism authorities)

Must always actively grasp the impacts of tourism development in general and human resource needs at the local, national, regional and international levels in particular in order to cooperate with relevant units (departments) to develop a plan to promote the development of high-quality human resources to adapt to the new types of tourism activities. Tourism businesses are following the development trends of the market mechanism. In particular, the Departments of Tourism need to proactively capture, monitor and closely manage tourism human resource

training institutions and enterprises participating in the labor import and export market. Furthermore, Departments of Tourism need to strictly implement regulations and regulations in accordance with the law in the field of training, export and import of human resources for the industry, ensuring both knowledge, capacity and skills in tourism activities.

Tourism human resource training institutions and tourism enterprises

(i) Managers operating training institutions at all levels should be fully aware of their position and responsibilities when conducting training activities at all levels and bringing human resources to the labor market and international activities, in order to: Organize, operate and deploy training activities in accordance with the objectives and tasks of the training institution under their management, ensuring high quality according to the standards; Identify and clearly recognize the social responsibility in training and human resource exchange activities for meeting social need, not for local economic benefits which lead to unfair competition;

(ii) There should be a connection between training institutions of the same level and levels from low to high, in order to achieve consistency in: training program; general and specific knowledge; evaluating results according to outcome standard, etc. The ultimate aim is to create suitable human resources meeting the requirements of national and international standards.

5. Conclusions

Developing high-quality human resources in general and the tourism

industry in particular is an objective requirement of the development process for each country when participating in the international labor market. Vietnam is a developing country, and the tourism industry is identified as a key economic sector in the structure of national economic development. Our country has abundant human resources with a rich and diverse cultural tradition and national identity. Therefore, these issues cannot be delayed or taken lightly. However, in order to develop high-quality tourism human resources, it is necessary to involve local authorities at all levels, manage related industries on the spirit of initiative, creativity and community responsibility in all activities, thereby determining comparative advantage (dynamic foundation) and responsiveness; market demand; developments in the process of developing high-quality human resources (training activities, cooperation and exchange, etc.); identify the problems that need to be solved for both the short-term period and the long-term period. Based on that, we can propose comprehensive and reasonable solutions and feasible recommendations to have human resources meet the standards and criteria on professional qualifications, skills and ability to participate in the international labor market. The author hope that the ideas and information presented in the paper contribute to a new perspective and new ways of managing and organizing the administration of authorities at all levels, tourism managers, tourism human resources training institutions; tourism businesses; fulfill their functions and tasks

given by the Party and the State to develop high-quality tourism human resources with a purpose of participating in the international labor market.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest

References

- Communist Party of Vietnam Central Committee (2017). *Resolution 08-QĐ/TW on Politburo's resolution on developing tourism into a key economic sector* (Origin in Vietnamese: Ban chấp hành Trung Ương Đảng, 2017. *Nghị Quyết 08-QĐ/TW về Phát triển du lịch trở thành ngành kinh tế mũi nhọn*).
- Institute for Tourism Development Research (2019). *Vietnam tourism development strategy to 2030, with a vision toward 2035*. Hanoi. (Origin in Vietnamese: Viện nghiên cứu Phát triển Du lịch, 2019. *Chiến lược phát triển du lịch Việt Nam đến năm 2030, tầm nhìn đến năm 2035*).
- Le Anh Tuan (2019). *Guideline and policy of party and government on Human tourism resource development. Proceedings of the conference on Developing human resources for tourism in Vietnam in the context of integration*, Van Hien University. (Origin in Vietnamese: Lê Anh Tuấn, 2019. *Chủ trương, chính sách của Đảng và nhà nước về phát triển nguồn nhân lực Du lịch, Kỷ yếu hội thảo Phát triển nguồn nhân lực Du lịch Việt Nam trong bối cảnh hội nhập*, Trường Đại học

- Văn Hiến).
- Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism (2016). Project “Enhancing social demand-oriented training in the tourism sector up to 2025” (Origin in Vietnamese: Bộ Văn hóa, Thể thao và Du lịch, 2016. *Đề án tăng cường đào tạo theo nhu cầu xã hội lĩnh vực du lịch đến năm 2025*).
- Ministry of Information and Communications (2018). *Vietnam ICT Index (2018)* (Origin in Vietnamese: Bộ Công nghệ thông tin và Truyền thông, *Báo cáo tóm tắt chỉ số sẵn sàng cho phát triển và ứng dụng CNTT-TT Việt Nam năm 2018*).
- Nguyen Van Dinh (2019). Human resources for tourism in Vietnam in the era of industrial revolution 4.0. *Proceedings of the Scientific Conference - Development trends of world tourism and its impact on Vietnam's tourism*, Institute for Tourism Development Research, Hanoi. (Origin in Vietnamese: Nguyễn Văn Đình, 2019. *Nhân lực du lịch Việt Nam trong thời kỳ cách mạng công nghiệp 4.0, Kỷ yếu Hội thảo khoa học - Xu hướng phát triển của du lịch thế giới và tác động đối với du lịch Việt Nam*, Viện Nghiên cứu Phát triển Du lịch, Hà Nội).
- Pham Xuan Hau and Nguyen Van Sy (2015). Supplying the high-quality and professional human resources: the main task in developing tourism in the Mekong Delta. *HCMC University of Education Journal of Science*, 4(69). (Origin in Vietnamese: Phạm Xuân Hậu, và Nguyễn Văn Sỹ, 2015. *Bổ sung nhân lực chất lượng cao và chuyên nghiệp, nhiệm vụ then chốt trong phát triển du lịch*, *Đồng bằng Sông Cửu Long, Tạp chí Khoa học Đại học Sư phạm thành phố Hồ Chí Minh*, 4(69)).
- Prime Minister (2011). *No. 2473/QĐ-TTg Decision on Approving the strategy for development of Vietnam's tourism through 2020, with a vision toward 2030*. Hanoi. (Origin in Vietnamese: Thủ tướng chính phủ, 2011. *Quyết định số 2473/QĐ-TTg phê duyệt Chiến lược phát triển du lịch Việt Nam đến năm 2020, tầm nhìn đến năm 2030*).
- The National Assembly (2017). *The Law on Tourism* (Origin Vietnamese: Quốc Hội, *Luật Du lịch*).
- Vietnam National Administration of Tourism. *Vietnam Tourism Annual Report 2013 - 2019* (Origin in Vietnamese: Tổng Cục Du lịch, *Báo cáo thường niên Du lịch Việt Nam giai đoạn 2013 - 2019*).
- WEF (2019). *The Travel and Tourism Competitiveness Report 2019*. World Economic Forum